

TENDER EVALUATION REPORT	CATEGORY:	Environment – Waste & Recycling
	INITIATIVE NUMBER & TITLE:	20-124 Purchase, Installation and Maintenance of Litter Bins
	YORtender REF:	DN509206
	CATEGORY MANAGER:	Joanne Kirk (Senior Procurement Category Manager)
	SERVICE LEAD:	Martin Raper

1. PURPOSE

The purpose of this tender evaluation report is to provide Tom Smith (Assistant Director, Community Safety and Street Scene) with a summary of the procurement process undertaken, the outcomes achieved along with any potential issues and risks in order to seek approval to move to contract award.

2. OBJECTIVES OF RESULTANT AGREEMENT

The objective of this agreement was to identify suitable providers to meet the Council's need for the supply, installation, maintenance and repair of litter bins across the Borough and provide a longer term arrangement to ensure consistency of supply, rather than spot purchasing ad-hoc requirements.

This requirement primarily includes the provision of solar smart bins, standard street litter bins and dual purpose litter/dog waste bins, however recognising the differences in the supply market for the different requirements, the procurement was split into 2 lots:

Lot 1 – solar smart bins

Lot 2 – standard street litter and dual purpose litter/dog waste bins.

3. KEY FACTS

3.1	Estimated Contract Value:	£1,500,000
3.2	Initial Contract Term (months):	36
3.3	Extension Options (months):	12
3.4	Route to Market:	Above EU Threshold open

		competition
3.5	Contract Notice Reference Number	2020/S 239-592209
3.6	Tender Closing Date:	08/01/2021
3.7	Number of Expressions of Interest Received:	8
3.8	Number of Tenders Received:	Lot 1 (Solar Bins): 4 Lot 2 (Litter and Dual Bins): 2
3.9	Details of Formal Opt Outs:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • BPi Recycled Products – cannot meet requirement, • Eco Mirage Ltd – Unable to be competitive, • Eco plastic wood – Unable to supply.

4.	5. EVALUATION		
5.1	Evaluation Panel Members		
Facilitator:	Joanne Kirk		
Compliance Checks:	Joanne Kirk		
Selection Criteria:	Selection Questionnaire – Pass/Fail only		
Award Criteria: Quality:	Lot 1(Solar Bins): 30% Quality / 20% Social Value Lot 2 (Litter and Dual Bins): 20% Quality / 20% Social Value		
Award Criteria: Price:	Lot 1(Solar Bins): 50% price Lot 2 (Litter and Dual Bins): 55% price / 5% Rebate		
5.2	Dates		
Individual Evaluation:	11/01/2021	to	26/01/2021
Moderation:	27/01/2021	to	29/01/2021
4.3	Summary Scores		
Detailed below is a summary of the evaluation. A copy of the full evaluation records can be obtained from the Category Manager within Procurement detailed at the top of this report.			

Bidder Name	Compliance	Selection Criteria	Award Criteria				Total Score
			Mandatory Criteria	Quality Score (out of 30)	Social Value Score (out of 20)	Price Score (out of 50)	
Lot 1 – Solar Bins							
British Bins Ltd	Pass	Pass	Pass	11.00	6.98	50.98	68.96
Egbert H Taylor Ltd	Pass	Pass	Pass	18.80	18.00	39.36	76.15
PEL (Somylon Equipment Ltd)	Pass	Pass	Pass	15.60	10.28	60.00	85.88
Wybone Ltd	Pass	Pass	Pass	12.20	9.08	37.53	58.81
Lot 2 – Standard Litter Bins and Dual Purpose Bins							
Bidder Name	Compliance	Selection Criteria	Award Criteria				Total Score
			Mandatory Criteria	Quality Score (out of 20)	Social Value Score (out of 20)	Price Score (out of 60)	
Leaffield Environmental Ltd	Pass	Pass	Pass	12.40	4.00	60.00	76.40
Wybone Ltd	Pass	Pass	Pass	18.80	17.00	41.39	82.19
4.4	Successful Bid(s) Details						
Bidders Name:	Lot 1 (Solar Bins): Somylon Equipment Ltd trading as PEL Lot 2 (Litter Bins and Dual Bins): Wybone Ltd						
Proposed Contract Value:	Lot 1 (Solar Bins): £700,000 (£457,958 priced for exact requirements but scope in contract award to allow for changing requirements over 4 year term subject to funding). Lot 2 (Litter Bins and Dual Bins): £800,000 (£496,250 priced for exact requirements but scope in contract award to allow for changing requirements over 4 year term subject to funding).						

4.5 Due Diligence

Due diligence questions have been satisfactorily answered by both bidders in regards to ensuring lead times and all circumstances remain as stated in tender documents.

Financial checks have been completed with no issues.

5 OUTCOMES ACHIEVED

£1.21million budget is approved for the entirety of the bin programme. In summary the expected contracted spend on prices received is £954,250 so an initial saving of £255,750 which will be used to cover the installation costs for the new lot 2 bins.

The table below details the costs broken down by bin type. The recent increase in competition within the solar bin market has driven down the price of the bins giving a substantial saving for lot 1. For lot 2 (standard and dual purpose bins) the expectation was that a plastic bin would be the best value option; however, as an unexpected benefit the preferred bidder will be providing steel bins which are substantially more sustainable and hardwearing and can potentially have a 10 year's life span so further savings could be gained from reduced damage/repair and replacement requirements beyond the contract term.

Bin Type	Budget	Contract Cost
Lot 1 – Solar Bins	£735,000	£458,000
Lot 2 – Standard & Dual Purpose Bins	£475,000	£496,250
Total:	£1,210,000	£954,250

In terms of social value there are no Rotherham suppliers capable of meeting the contract requirements and for lot 1 there is no UK manufacturer of solar bins. However, for lot 2 the successful supplier is based just outside the Rotherham boundary in Barnsley so within the Sheffield City Region. For lot 1 PEL have offered to donate £2,000 of PPE to a local organisation focussed on community clean-up activities plus one full day of mentoring to local MSME's to provide advice on growing their business. For lot 2 Wybone have offered a small FTE value for a Rotherham individual who will be employed on the project plus commitments to the UK real living wage for all employees.

6 RISKS / ISSUES

No risks were identified as high in the business case following mitigation action and all potential issues have been addressed within the evaluation methodology and satisfactorily answered by the preferred bidders including an understanding of the suppliers approach to managing modern day slavery risks within the supply chain, which was of importance due to some solar bin manufacturing taking place in countries with known forced labour and

human trafficking activities.

7 RECOMMENDATION

Following the evaluation for this tender it is the recommendation of the project team that the Council progresses to issue an intent to award to PEL (Somyon Equipment Ltd) for Lot 1 and Wybone Ltd for lot 2.

8 NEXT STEPS

Issue Intent to award and start 10 day standstill period. A Regulation 84 report is required to be completed by the Category Manager and the service must ensure an Officer Delegated Decision Record accompanies this report.

It is essential that Services have liaised with Committee Services to ensure the decision is recorded on the forward plan. The decision record should be published on (or around) the time the formal award is made (i.e. after standstill has expired)

Following standstill the contract terms and conditions will be completed and submitted electronically via docusign for signature

9 REPORT AUTHOR AND APPROVER

9.4 Report Author

Name: Joanne Kirk (Senior Procurement Category Manager)

Date: 08/02/2021

9.5 Reviewed by Head of Procurement (or deputy)

Name: Karen Middlebrook

Date: 10/02/2021

9.6 Tom Smith (Assistant Director; Community Safety & Street Scene)

Name: Tom Smith

Evidence: Embed a copy of the email approval

Date: 12/02/2021